

Minutes Bibliographic Standards Committee

Virtual ALA Midwinter Meeting
Zoom, Friday, January 29, 2021
11:00 - 12:30 pm EDT



Agenda

1. Welcome and announcements
2. Review of draft minutes from the BSC virtual meeting on December 18, 2020 (Matković)
3. Reports on BSC activities
 - a. RBMS RDA Editorial Group (Hobart)
 - b. Program Planning Group (Mongeau)
 - c. Web Resources for the Rare Materials Cataloger (Ducmanas)
4. Controlled Vocabularies Editorial Group liaisons (Bychowski)
5. RBMS BSC Task Group on Addressing Diversity, Equity, and Inclusion in Bibliographic Standards and in Bibliographic Description (BSC chairs)
6. Closing announcements (BSC chairs, all)

Appendix A: BSC Minutes 2020-10-06

Appendix B: BSC Minutes 2020-12-18

Members present: Jennifer MacDonald, University of Delaware Library (co-chair); Honor Moody, Harvard Library (co-chair); Liz Adams, Duke University; Emily Baldoni, Georgetown University; Katelyn Borbely, College for Creative Studies; Amy Brown, Boston College, Burns Library; Valerie Buck, Brigham Young University; Brenna Bychowski, Beinecke Library, Yale University (ex officio: Controlled Vocabularies Editorial Group co-editor); kalan Knudson Davis, University of Minnesota Libraries; Tammy Druash, University of North Florida; Matthew Ducmanas, Temple University; Alison Greenlee, Wayne State University; Jessica Grzegorski, Newberry Library (RBMS Web Team liaison); Ryan Hildebrand, University of Oregon; Elizabeth Hobart, Pennsylvania State University; Linda Isaac, Houghton Library, Harvard University; Deborah J. Leslie, Folger Shakespeare Library; Rafael Linares; Michelle Mascaro, University of California San Diego; Danijela Matković, Beinecke Library, Yale University (secretary); Philippe Mongeau, Rare Book School; Iris O'Brien, British Library; Lauren Reno, Duke University (ex officio: Controlled Vocabularies Editorial Group co-editor); Brian Stearns, University of Alberta; Amy Tims, American Antiquarian Society; Brittney Washington, Harry Ransom Center

Members absent: Jessie Sherwood, Robbins Collection, University of California Berkeley

Visitors: Matthew Beacom, Beinecke Library, Yale University; Erin Blake, Folger Shakespeare Library; Ruth Carruth, Beinecke Library, Yale University; Annie Copeland, Penn State University; Zoe Dobbs, Beinecke Library, Yale University; Jennifer Dunlap, Houghton Library, Harvard University; Matthew Haugen, Columbia University; Sarah Hoover, UNC-Chapel Hill; Sarah Hovde, University of Maryland Libraries; Amy Jordan, American Antiquarian Society;

Jason Kovari, Cornell University; Elizabeth Kuntz, American Heritage Center, University of Wyoming; Maggie Long, Wesleyan University; Rebecca Malek-Wiley, Tulane University; Joan Milligan, University of Dayton; Ann Myers, Stanford University; Jackie Parascandola, University of Pennsylvania; Audrey Pearson, Beinecke Library, Yale University; Katy Rawdon, Temple University; Sara Schliep, Folger Shakespeare Library; Nina Schneider, Clark Library, UCLA; Noah Sheola, Boston College; Gina Solares, University of San Francisco; Duncan Stewart, University of Iowa Libraries; Manon Th  roux, Library of Congress (Library of Congress liaison)

1. Welcome and announcements

The co-chairs welcomed attendees and reviewed meeting norms. Amy Brown volunteered to monitor chat participation.

2. Review of draft minutes from the BSC virtual meeting on December 18, 2020 (Matkovi  )

There were no questions regarding the December 18, 2020 draft minutes. The minutes were approved via a Zoom poll during the meeting.

3. Reports on BSC activities

a. RBMS RDA Editorial Group (Hobart)

Elizabeth Hobart, chair of the RBMS RDA Editorial Group, submitted a [report](#) and presented on the group's recent activities relating to the preparation of Descriptive Cataloging of Rare Materials (RDA Edition) (DCRMR). DCRMR will be a consolidated, integrating resource, which will be available on the RBMS info website. Hobart announced that the group completed a draft version for books and that other formats will be added later. The Editorial Group also plans to publish a set of light-weight policy statements for the RDA Toolkit, which will link back to more detailed instructions in DCRMR.

Hobart walked attendees through the contents of the new manual and highlighted that chapters were kept in the order most familiar to catalogers, i.e. title, statement of responsibility, edition, etc. The appendix currently contains two items: Abbreviations for creators, publishers, printers, etc. (Appendix J) and Mapping from DCRM to DCRMR (Appendix K). Hobart demonstrated the functionalities of the new manual by discussing in detail the layout of the title chapter and noted that the group will soon complete its internal review.

Hobart announced that the Editorial Group is seeking ca. 10 volunteers to review the new text. Anyone attending the BSC meeting may volunteer, but current BSC members will be given preference. Each reviewer will be assigned 2-3 chapters depending on the length of the chapters. In addition, the group is looking for volunteers who would be interested in reading the full text.

The timeline for chapter reviewers is four weeks and for full-text reviewers six weeks. Hobart anticipates the reviewing process to begin some time in February.

Responding to a question whether the new manual will be available as an e-book, Hobart stated that the Editorial Group plans on making available a PDF version of DCRM.

b. Program Planning Group (Mongeau)

The current Program Planning Group consists of co-chairs Philippe Mongeau and Elizabeth Hobart as well as group members Elizabeth Adams and Jessie Sherwood. Philippe Mongeau provided a summary of [the Program Planning Group report](#). Sessions that were originally accepted for the RBMS 2020 conference, which had to be canceled due to the COVID-19 pandemic, will be invited to present at RBMS 2021. The RBMS conference this year will be held virtually and it will retain last year's conference theme: Power, Resistance, and Leadership. The dates and the platform of the virtual conference have not been announced yet.

In March 2020, following a call for additional topics for RBMS 2021, the Program Planning Group sent out a survey to BSC members to determine interest. Mongeau listed the following sessions that received most interest:

Workshops

1. Cataloging Serials, with an introduction to the DCRM Serials examples

Participatory Panels (both sessions received an equal amount of interest)

1. Topics of conversations between catalogers and non-catalogers
2. Booksellers and library catalogers discuss rare materials cataloging in both fields (using standards, sharing data, and other ideas)

Seminars

1. "From RDA Policy Statements to DCRM2": Outlining the DCRM2

See the [Program Planning Group report](#) for the full list and details of the survey results.

A brief discussion followed where the possibility was brought up that some of these proposed sessions could move forward as e-events outside of the RBMS conference framework. It was also noted that the RBMS 2022 conference theme is related to the COVID-19 pandemic.

c. Web Resources for the Rare Materials Cataloger (Ducmanas)

Members Katelyn Borbely and Matthew Ducmanas submitted a [report](#) on activities relating to the Web Resources for the Rare Materials Cataloger directory. In July 2017 a working group was formed to evaluate the Web Resources directory and to investigate migrating the resource to rbms. The group redesigned the directory and made it available to the public in September 2019.

Ducmanas reported that the group periodically initiates a checking of the links in the directory to ensure functionality. The group has also begun to work on establishing basic editorial guidelines for the directory. Ducmanas highlighted three areas the group intends to continue to work on: improve search functionality, add new content, and raise awareness of the resource.

4. Controlled Vocabularies Editorial Group liaisons (Bychowski)

Brenna Bychowski, co-editor of the Controlled Vocabularies Editorial Group (CVEG), provided a summary of the group's recent ALA Midwinter meeting on January 27, 2021.

CVEG spent the first part of their meeting with an update from the RBMS CV Prejudicial Materials Working Group led by Ryan Hildebrandt. The group, consisting of members from both CVEG and the Diversity Committee as well as other catalogers, has been reevaluating current terms that exist in CV for prejudicial or potentially offensive materials. In addition, the group has been considering additional terms and relationship designators for inclusion.

The second part of CVEG's meeting was devoted to an update on the thesaurus integration and linked open data publication work. The integration of the six thesauri into one has been completed and the new thesaurus is currently being encoded. CVEG will be reaching out to seek feedback on the layout and content of the landing page information on id.loc.gov.

5. RBMS BSC Task Group on Addressing Diversity, Equity, and Inclusion in Bibliographic Standards and in Bibliographic Description (BSC chairs)

Following discussions at the last BSC virtual meeting relating to potentially harmful language in bibliographic descriptions, inclusive metadata, and remediation, the co-chairs drafted a charge for a new BSC Task Group on Addressing Diversity, Equity, and Inclusion in Bibliographic Standards and in Bibliographic Description. The group will be chaired by Linda Isaac and Matthew Haugen. The group is expected to have an actionable report ready at ALA Annual.

The charge of the new group will be shared once the co-chairs incorporate feedback from members of the new task group and the Diversity Committee.

6. Closing announcements (BSC chairs, all)

Liz Adams announced that there are currently 72 entries in the Rare Materials Catalogers Directory. She thanked participants and invited attendees to spread the news about the new resource.

The remainder of the meeting was dedicated to introductions of all attendees.

The co-chairs announced that they will send out a doodle poll for the next virtual meeting in March.

The meeting closed at 12.18 p.m.

Respectfully submitted March 8, 2021 by Danijela Matković, RBMS Bibliographic Standards Committee secretary.

Appendix A: BSC Minutes 2020-10-06

Minutes Bibliographic Standards Committee

Virtual Meeting

Zoom, Tuesday, October 6, 2020

11:30 - 12:30 pm EDT



Agenda

1. Welcome and announcements
2. Review of draft BSC minutes, June 15, 2020, virtual ALA annual meeting
3. Updates from the BSC Chairs
4. RBMS RDA Editorial Group: Report (Hobart)
5. Standard Citation Forms Editorial Team: Report (Sherwood)
6. Indexing of 510 field (Lapka)
7. Closing announcements

Members present: Honor Moody, Harvard Library (co-chair); Jennifer MacDonald, University of Delaware Library (co-chair); Francis Lapka, Yale Center for British Art; Katelyn Borbely, College for Creative Studies; Brenna Bychowski, Beinecke Library, Yale University (ex officio: Controlled Vocabularies Editorial Group co-editor); Lauren Reno, Duke University (ex officio: Controlled Vocabularies Editorial Group co-editor); kalan Knudson Davis, University of Minnesota Libraries; Matthew Ducmanas, Temple University; Alison Greenlee, Wayne State University; Elizabeth Hobart, Pennsylvania State University; Linda Isaac, Houghton Library, Harvard; Deborah J. Leslie, Folger Shakespeare Library; Rafael A. Linares Blasini; Michelle Mascaro, University of California San Diego; Philippe Mongeau, Rare Book School; Iris O'Brien, British Library; Jessie Sherwood, Robbins Collection, University of California Berkeley; Brian Stearns, University of Alberta; Brittney Washington, Harry Ransom Center; Tammy Druash, University of North Florida; Jessica Grzegorski, Newberry Library (RBMS Web Team liaison); Ryan Hildebrand, University of Oregon; Danijela Matković, Beinecke Library, Yale University (secretary); Emily Baldoni, Georgetown University; Liz Adams, Duke University; Valerie Buck, Brigham Young University

Members absent: Amy Brown, Boston College, Burns Library

Visitors: Kate S. Moriarty, Saint Louis University; Zoe Dobbs, Beinecke Library, Yale University; Sarah Hoover, University of North Carolina-Chapel Hill; Martha McTear, University of California Santa Barbara; Ann Myers, Stanford University; Audrey Pearson, Beinecke Library, Yale University; Amy Tims, American Antiquarian Society; Robert Steele, Jacob Burns Law Library, George Washington University; Todd Fell, Beinecke Library, Yale University; Amy Jordan, American Antiquarian Society; Jackie Parascandola, University of Pennsylvania; Maren Cornett, University of Delaware; Manon Théroux, Library of Congress (Library of Congress liaison); Jason Kovari, Cornell University; Matthew Haugen, Columbia University; Erin Blake,

Folger Shakespeare Library; Kathryn Downing, Helen Fowler Library, Denver Botanic Gardens; Ruth Carruth, Beinecke Library, Yale University; Lynne Fors, William & Mary; Maria Oldal, Morgan Library & Museum; Joy Orillo-Dotson, Manuscripts Division, Library of Congress; Abigail Connick, Smith College; Paloma Graciani Picardo, Harry Ransom Center; Maggie Long, Wesleyan University; Tad Boehmer, Michigan State University

1. Welcome and announcements

The co-chairs welcomed attendees and thanked outgoing chair Francis Lapka and outgoing secretary Kate S. Moriarty for their service. They reviewed meeting norms and announced that Alison Greenlee was the Zoom monitor for the meeting, and that she would be monitoring chat participation.

2. Review of draft BSC minutes, June 15, 2020, virtual ALA annual meeting

There were no questions regarding the June 15, 2020 draft minutes. The minutes were approved unanimously via a Zoom poll during the meeting.

3. Updates from the BSC Chairs

No items.

4. Report of the Descriptive Cataloging of Rare Materials (RDA Edition) Editorial Group (Elizabeth Hobart)

The Editorial Group co-chairs submitted a [report](#) and Elizabeth Hobart presented on the group's recent progress in developing an RDA-compliant cataloging standard for rare materials. See "RBMS RDA Editorial Group update" on the [BSC Meeting Documents page](#) for the presentation slides.

Descriptive Cataloging of Rare Materials (RDA Edition) (DCRMR) will be a consolidated, integrating resource. The initial instructions will be limited to books, other formats will be added over time. The DCRMR instructions will align with RDA elements. To facilitate catalogers' workflows, chapters will be arranged in an order adapted from ISBD and MARC.

The group has finalized the draft instructions for books. A Github repository has been established and all files have been migrated to the repository. The RBMS Executive Committee approved the creation of a subdomain on the RBMS info website.

Hobart explained the new numbering scheme of Descriptive Cataloging of Rare Materials (RDA Edition) (DCRMR). DCRMR will use a four-part numbering scheme based on chapter number, RDA element, section number, and instruction number.

Timeline and next steps: The editorial group plans to submit the book instructions to the BSC in January 2021. The policy statements will be released for public review in spring of 2021. Early in 2021, the group will begin to incorporate other formats. Updates will be posted on the RBMS info website.

5. Standard Citation Forms Editorial Team: Report (Sherwood)

Jessie Sherwood summarized the [Standard Citation Forms Editorial Team report](#).

The editorial team completed a 6-month pilot project which aimed at integrating URIs of the matching instance in id.loc.gov into new SCF citation records. Approximately 30% of the records that the team created in 2020 did not have an id.loc.gov match which rendered some of the Linked Data Working Group's recommendations infeasible. The SFC editorial team does not have the capacity to create new authority records for citations that are not in id.loc.gov and there seem to be no alternatives.

A discussion followed addressing challenges related to creating URIs for records not in id.loc.gov. It was mentioned that the PCC Wikidata Pilot project, which was launched in August, might provide additional insights and solutions. The migration of SFC to a different platform was briefly discussed. It was decided that there is no need to make a decision related to these matters now.

6. Indexing of 510 field (Lapka)

Francis Lapka reported on the fact that OCLC currently does not index citations (510 fields), with the exception of SCIPPIO records. OCLC will consider a change if this is supported by the RBMS community. Lapka discussed some [example use cases](#) that were introduced during a DCRM-L discussion in September. Lapka noted that the use cases strongly indicate interest in the indexing of citations. A brief discussion followed and the consensus was that the BSC should put forward a statement that endorses the indexing of 510s.

Action Item: Lapka will write a draft statement for BSC to vote on during the next couple of weeks.

7. Closing announcements

The co-chairs announced that the next meeting will take place either late November or early December. The meeting will be scheduled for 90 minutes.

The meeting closed at 12.28 p.m.

Respectfully submitted October 29, 2020 by Danijela Matković, RBMS Bibliographic Standards Committee secretary.

Appendix B: BSC Minutes 2020-12-18

Minutes Bibliographic Standards Committee

Virtual Meeting

Zoom, Friday, December 18, 2020

11:00 - 12:30 pm EDT



Agenda

1. Welcome and announcements
2. Updates from the BSC Chairs/Lapka
3. Review of draft BSC minutes, October 6, 2020, virtual meeting
4. Reports on BSC activities:
 - a. MARC/RDA Working Group liaison report (Davis)
 - b. RBMS-ARLIS/NA-SAA Joint Task Force on Development of the Art and Rare Materials BIBFRAME Ontology Extension (Kovari)
 - c. RBMS BSC Rare Materials Catalogers Directory (Linares)
 - d. OCLC Member Merge Guidelines for Rare Materials (Hildebrand)
5. Library of Congress Liaison to RBMS BSC (Thérroux)
6. Closing discussion and announcements

Members present: Jennifer MacDonald, University of Delaware Library (co-chair); Honor Moody, Harvard Library (co-chair); Liz Adams, Duke University; Emily Baldoni, Georgetown University; Katelyn Borbely, College for Creative Studies; Amy Brown, Boston College, Burns Library; Brenna Bychowski, Beinecke Library, Yale University (ex officio: Controlled Vocabularies Editorial Group co-editor); kalan Knudson Davis, University of Minnesota Libraries; Matthew Ducmanas, Temple University; Tammy Druash, University of North Florida; Alison Greenlee, Wayne State University; Jessica Grzegorski, Newberry Library (RBMS Web Team liaison); Ryan Hildebrand, University of Oregon; Elizabeth Hobart, Pennsylvania State University; Linda Isaac, Houghton Library, Harvard; Francis Lapka, Yale Center for British Art; Deborah J. Leslie, Folger Shakespeare Library; Rafael Linares; Michelle Mascaro, University of California San Diego; Philippe Mongeau, Rare Book School; Danijela Matković, Beinecke Library, Yale University (secretary); Iris O'Brien, British Library; Jessie Sherwood, Robbins Collection, University of California Berkeley; Brian Stearns, University of Alberta; Amy Tims, American Antiquarian Society; Brittney Washington, Harry Ransom Center

Members absent: Lauren Reno, Duke University (ex officio: Controlled Vocabularies Editorial Group co-editor); Valerie Buck, Brigham Young University

Visitors: Erin Blake, Folger Shakespeare Library; Cindy Cline, University of Kentucky; Ellen Cordes, Lewis Walpole Library, Yale University; Zoe Dobbs, Beinecke Library, Yale University; Stephanie Fell, University of Nevada, Las Vegas; Matthew Haugen, Columbia University;

Yoonha Hwang, Yale Center for British Art; Jason Kovari, Cornell University; Elizabeth Kuntz, American Heritage Center, University of Wyoming; Maggie Long, Wesleyan University; Rebecca Malek-Wiley, Tulane University; Andrea Martin; Martha McTear, University of California Santa Barbara; Jackie Parascandola, University of Pennsylvania; Audrey Pearson, Beinecke Library, Yale University; Paloma Graciani Picardo, Harry Ransom Center; Krista Stracka, National Library of Medicine; Manon Th  roux, Library of Congress (Library of Congress liaison)

1. Welcome and announcements

The co-chairs welcomed attendees and pointed to an added column in the sign-up sheet allowing attendees to introduce themselves to the group. Emily Baldoni served as Zoom wrangler, i.e. she admitted attendees, shared the sign-up sheet, and monitored chat participation.

2. Updates from the BSC Chairs/Lapka

Francis Lapka gave an update on the indexing of bibliographic references in OCLC. He wrote a statement on behalf of BSC endorsing the indexing of 510s. The statement was unanimously approved by BSC members and submitted to OCLC. According to Lapka, Jay Weitz indicated that OCLC will consider this issue as part of their indexing discussions which are related to a larger database restructuring project.

3. Review of draft BSC minutes, October 6, 2020, virtual meeting

There were no questions regarding the October 6, 2020 draft minutes. The minutes were approved via a Zoom poll during the meeting.

4. Reports on BSC activities

a. MARC/RDA Working Group liaison report (Davis)

Kalan Knudson Davis, the new Rare books and manuscripts specialist to the MARC/RDA Working Group (MRWG), submitted a [report](#) and presented on recent activities that are relevant to the special collections community.

Davis briefly introduced MRWG's discussion paper on the recording of data provenance in MARC formats which provides among others detailed information regarding the potential increased adoption and use of subfields \$5 and \$2.

Davis proceeded to discuss a proposal on types of binding, in particular item-specific bindings. She reported that both MRWG and MAC were disinclined to use the 340 field for two different

entities (manifestation and item) and to permit \$5 in this field. Davis proposed to further explore the issues and called for volunteers to work on a discussion paper.

b. RBMS-ARLIS/NA-SAA Joint Task Force on Development of the Art and Rare Materials BIBFRAME Ontology Extension (Kovari)

Jason Kovari, RBMS co-chair of the joint task force, gave a [presentation](#) detailing the work completed by the group: simplified the ontology extension and aligned it more closely with BIBFRAME, deprecated both the custodial history and activity models, added a generic events model, and updated the [GitHub repository](#).

Kovari listed the following tasks as outstanding: create usage guidelines and a human-readable version of the ontology files; finalize decisions relating to the exhibition model and the usage of vocabularies.

The task force anticipates wrapping up in February 2021. The work will then be handed over to BSC, ARLIS, and SAA for further discussions. A hosting site for the ontology has not been identified yet.

c. RBMS BSC Rare Materials Catalogers Directory (Linares)

The editors of the BSC Rare Materials Catalogers Directory submitted an [update](#) of their work. Rafael Linares, who joined Liz Adams as co-editor of the directory in the summer of 2020, demonstrated some of the features of the directory and announced that the site is ready for rollout. The co-editors will send out email announcements in early January. Both Linares and Adams encouraged participation and called for feedback.

d. OCLC Member Merge Guidelines for Rare Materials (Hildebrand)

Ryan Hildebrand reported on the [work](#) of the BSC's Rare Materials Merge working group. The group is tasked with providing rare materials guidance for participants in OCLC's Member Merge program which allows institutions to merge master records. The group completed guidelines for books. They were approved by the BSC and can be found on the [OCLC website](#). Draft guidelines for continuing resources are under review by OCLC. Members of the working group are currently working on guidelines for cartographic and graphic materials.

A brief discussion followed relating to the amount of time it can take to merge records and the number of catalogers at an institution that are being trained to participate in the Merge program.

5. Library of Congress Liaison to RBMS BSC (Théroux)

Manon Théroux, Library of Congress liaison, provided a [report](#) on the project to develop LC-PCC policy statements for the new version of RDA released in mid-December 2020 as a result of the RDA Toolkit Restructure and Redesign Project (3R). Previously available as a beta version, it has now become the official version of RDA and draft LC-PCC policy statements are visible. Théroux emphasized that the new RDA version has not been implemented yet by LC/PCC and that the draft policy statements are under review. She highlighted three sections of her report: project staff, challenges, and policy statements pertaining to rare materials. Théroux then opened it up for questions and it was briefly mentioned that the RBMS RDA Editorial Group has not had the opportunity yet to discuss the new manifestation statement elements in detail.

6. Closing discussion and announcements

The co-chairs noted conversations that took place recently on the dcrm list relating to statements and guidelines on the remediation of harmful language in metadata descriptions. A discussion followed touching on various aspects, including the different challenges that harmful materials pose in contrast to harmful vocabularies and the need for an official BSC position statement. It was agreed that a group should be formed to address some of the issues discussed and attendees were encouraged to volunteer.

The co-chairs welcomed feedback on participants' zoom user experience and announced that they will send out a doodle poll for the ALA Midwinter virtual meeting.

The meeting closed at 12.28 p.m.

Respectfully submitted January 18, 2021 by Danijela Matković, RBMS Bibliographic Standards Committee secretary.