

Date: June 1, 2008

To: Association for Library Service to Children
Board of Directors

From: *ALSC Awards Eligibility Task Force*
Carolyn S. Brodie, chair
Members: Dudley Carlson, Terry Borzumato Greenburg, John
Mason and Judy Zuckerman

Subject: Task Force Final report

Background

This task force was appointed by then ALSC President, KT Horning after the annual conference in 2006. The task force began work in the fall of 2006 with a conference call. We then met at the following conferences: 2007 ALA Midwinter; 2007 Annual and 2008 Midwinter. In between conference meetings we have scheduled a number of conference calls and worked through email discussions.

ALSC Awards Eligibility Task Force Function Statement

The function statement of the ALSC Awards Eligibility Task Force has been:

"To examine existing terms for ALSC award committees concerning publisher and author/illustrator eligibility; to make recommendations to the ALSC Board to clarify and/or change existing terms.

Timeline and History

When our task force met by conference call in fall 2006 we decided to conduct a survey of past award chairs regarding award eligibility issues. At the same time we conducted a parallel survey of selected individuals involved in the field of children's literature. The survey questions were created via email correspondence and were finalized at 2007 ALA Midwinter. The surveys were conducted in February/March 2007 using Survey Monkey. We thank the ALSC office for helping us obtain email addresses for past award chairs.

Also during this period, each task force member was assigned a particular award manual to review in regard to eligibility criteria. These manuals included Newbery, Caldecott, Sibert, Geisel and Batchelder.

With the combination of the valuable information gained from the survey and our own reviews of the manuals we developed a list of terms at 2007 ALA Annual

that we agreed needed to be further defined, clarified and/or changed. These terms fell into three categories and our final document is arranged in this manner:

- I. Eligibility of Publisher
- II. Eligibility of Book
- III. Eligibility of Author/Illustrator

We worked on these terms from summer 2007 through 2008 ALA Midwinter and through spring 2008. Attached is our final document. Once this document is reviewed and approved, we recommend that it be incorporated into the relevant award manuals in print and on the ALSC website.

Thank you

With her past Priority Group Consultant experience to the ALSC awards committees, Dudley Carlson has been instrumental in this process. Dudley has added the examples throughout the document that help to clarify many of the terms.

The chair would like to thank Dudley and the other task force members---John Mason, Terry Borzumato-Greenburg and Judy Zimmerman for their willingness to work on this project for the past two years and for their great wisdom and knowledge about the field of children's literature. Each of the individuals working on this project brought incredible expertise to the table and it was a pleasure working with each of them.

The task force would like to thank KT Horning for twice reviewing the attached document during spring 2008.

**ALSC ELIGIBILITY AWARDS TASK FORCE
Definitions**

Table of Contents

I Eligibility of Publisher

- (A) Simultaneous
- (B) Originally Published in the United States
- (C) Co-publication
- (D) U.S. Publisher/American Publisher
- (E) Published
- (F) Publication Date
- (G) Distributed
- (H) Editorial Work
- (I) Editorial Office
- (J) American Literature for Children

II Eligibility of Book

- (A) Original Work
- (B) In English
- (C) Children's Book
- (D) Book
- (E) Distinguished, Outstanding

III Eligibility of Author/Illustrator

- (A) Resident
- (B) Citizen

ALSC AWARDS ELIGIBILITY TASK FORCE

DEFINITIONS

Note: Although **bold** and underlined text are used both for emphasis and to differentiate sections, text in RED indicates that a policy change is involved.

I. ELIGIBILITY OF PUBLISHER

(A) *SIMULTANEOUS*

SIMULTANEOUS - means "at the same time." For purposes of these awards, "published simultaneously" means that a book was first published in the United States within the same calendar year that it was first published in any other country, whether or not the actual dates of publication are identical.

Example:

How I Live Now, by Meg Rosoff, was published in 2004 by Wendy Lamb/Random House, and "simultaneously" published in Great Britain. It was explained by the editor, Wendy Lamb, that the book had been jointly acquired by the US and British publishers; that editorial work had, from the beginning, been a joint process by the two editors; and that every effort had been made to be sure that the two editions were, literally, simultaneous. However, certain procedures specific to each publisher were impossible to manipulate (such as Tuesday always being publication day in the US while the British publication day was always Thursday for these publishers). For this reason, the British edition was actually released a few days - but only a few days - before the US edition. The book was ruled eligible with regard to date.

Because of such unavoidable differences, which sometimes cover weeks or months instead of days, it was subsequently decided that publication within the same calendar year provides a more reasonable means of establishing eligibility, whether or not publication is actually simultaneous. This reflects a CHANGE from previous procedure.

Note: This example does not address other issues, such as the age level of *How I Live Now*, nor the fact that Rosoff is a resident of the U.K. It is

unknown at this writing whether she will maintain her U.S. citizenship permanently.

(B) ORIGINALLY PUBLISHED IN THE UNITED STATES

ORIGINALLY PUBLISHED IN THE UNITED STATES - means that the acquisition of the book and the editorial work were done by a publisher with editorial offices in the United States that publishes books under U.S. publishing conventions for a United States market. A book may be published "simultaneously" (see above) in another country, provided the acquisition and editorial work were done jointly or originated in the U.S.

Examples:

1. As in the example above, Rosoff's *How I Live Now* was considered eligible because the editorial work was done JOINTLY. Had the editorial work been done only by the British editor, the book would have been ineligible.
2. Numerous books have been declared ineligible because their publishers, although they have an "office" somewhere in the US, actually do the editorial work in another country. See below.

(C) CO-PUBLICATION

CO-PUBLICATION - means that the book was released simultaneously (see above) in the United States and another country after joint acquisition and/or editorial work by both publishers.

(D) U.S PUBLISHER / AMERICAN PUBLISHER

U.S. PUBLISHER and AMERICAN PUBLISHER - are used synonymously to mean a publisher with editorial offices in the United States. Publishers who maintain warehouse or distribution facilities in the U.S. but whose primary editorial offices are in other countries are specifically excluded.

(E) PUBLISHED

PUBLISHED - means prepared and issued for public sale. This includes the acquisition, editorial work and release of a book and may (or may not) also include marketing and promotion.

Example:

Eragon, by Christopher Paolini, was originally self-published by Paolini International, Livingston, Montana, in 2002. Subsequently, in 2003, it was published by Random House. Because the first edition had been sold locally and distributed by the author, the Random House edition was ineligible.

The same would have been true had the original publication been by any smaller publisher, rather than by the author.

(F) PUBLICATION DATE

PUBLICATION DATE - means what a specific publisher deems it to mean when announcing when a book is, or will be, published. In some cases, the date refers to the date on which a book is released for sale to the public; in others, the date on which it is shipped from the publisher's warehouse to wholesalers or retailers. In all cases, the "publication date" refers to that date declared by the publisher to be the book's publication date. As this date sometimes changes, it is important in determining eligibility to verify that the date used is the book's final, actual publication date and not merely the date of copyright or the date first announced.

Verification of publication dates, in cases where there is a question, should be done by the Chair or Priority Consultant with the assistance of ALSC staff if needed.

Publication dates may initially be determined from the book itself; from the publisher's web site; or from such sources as LOC.gov, Amazon.com (and Amazon.uk), or distributors' web sites. When books are seen in prepublication format or there is uncertainty, the publisher should be contacted.

(G) DISTRIBUTED

DISTRIBUTED - means transmitted from the publisher to the wholesale or retail seller and may (or may not) also include marketing and promotion.

Example: Publishers Group West distributes the books of many small publishers (Children's Book Press, Lee and Low, Island Press and others).

(H) EDITORIAL WORK

EDITORIAL WORK - means the negotiation process between author or illustrator and editor that leads from initial manuscript to finished book. It may include conversations, correspondence, written instructions, markings on drafts, or other communication about the book.

Example:

In the Rosoff example above, the editors worked with the author to shape the original manuscript, correct errors, etc. The two editors also held conversations with the author about the best choice of words to make the book equally readable in both countries.

Additional examples from one of the great editors of children's books may be found in the wonderful correspondence collected by Leonard Marcus in *Dear Genius: The Letters of Ursula Nordstrom* (HarperCollins, 1998).

(I) EDITORIAL OFFICE

EDITORIAL OFFICE - means the place where "editorial work" is officially done. While it is recognized that many editors work at home, in transit, and in locations other than "offices," the location of the Editorial Office refers to the business address at which such work originates and/or is managed. Secondary or subsidiary offices are specifically excluded.

"Editorial work" (see above) specifically refers to the process of refining the manuscript from its original draft or proposal to its finished form. An office that acquires the original manuscript or distributes the completed book is not considered an "editorial office" unless the work of editing is also done there.

Example: Several Canadian publishers have maintained offices in the state of New York and elsewhere in the United States to facilitate their interactions with US writers and illustrators while performing editorial work at their Canadian headquarters. These publishers, while they have US offices, are not considered US publishers for purposes of these awards.

(J) AMERICAN LITERATURE FOR CHILDREN

AMERICAN LITERATURE FOR CHILDREN - means books published in the United States for children up to and including age 14. "American Literature," in this sense, refers to the origin of the book, and not to the

What's
the
authoritative
source?
Printed in
the book?

no

time or location where the action takes place. Nor does it refer to the characters or actions within the book.

II ELIGIBILITY OF BOOK

(A) ORIGINAL WORK

The term "original work" may have several meanings. For purposes of these awards, it is defined as follows:

1. "Original work" means that the text (or illustrations, as applicable) was created by this writer or artist and no one else.

IN PRINT

Ex: Action
Jackson

2. Further, "original work" means that the text (or illustrations, as applicable) is presented here for the first time and has not been previously published elsewhere in this or any other form. Text or illustrations reprinted or compiled from other sources are not eligible.

Tar
Beach

Example 2a: *Bread and Jam for Frances* and *A Baby Sister for Frances*, published in 1964 with illustrations by Lillian Hoban, were republished in "newly illustrated" editions in 1993. Although color had been added, the characters in and composition of the scenes were substantially the same. The illustrations were therefore ineligible.

Example 2b: *Joseph Had a Little Overcoat*, by Simms Taback (1999), had been published in a 1977 edition also illustrated by Taback. The new edition was considered eligible for the 2000 Caldecott award because the illustrations were entirely new.

Example 2c: Brian Selznick's *The Invention of Hugo Cabret: a novel in words and pictures* contains visual quotations from the films of French cinematographer Georges Méliès. As with quotations in a book review, these are a minor portion of the illustrations and the book was considered eligible. Other illustrators - for example, Jon Agee in *The Incredible Painting of Felix Clousseau* - have used such visual quotations from external sources.

3. If a portion of a book was previously published elsewhere - for instance, in a magazine, a collection of short stories or in electronic format - then the amount of previously published material must be a minor portion of the entire work. The substantial majority of the book must be wholly new, original and previously unpublished.

Example: A chapter in *A Long Way from Chicago*, by Richard Peck (Newbery Honor, 1999) had previously been published as a short story. However, this chapter was a minor part of the book, which was much longer. The book was ruled eligible.

4. In the case of the Sibert award, illustrations previously published or compiled from other sources may be used. In this case, however, the award would be presented only to the author and not to the artist or artists. Since information books are frequently adapted from a variety of sources, the guiding principle should be whether the book, taken as a whole, is a substantially new and original contribution to the subject, rather than mainly an adaptation of a previous publication.

Example: Susan Campbell Bartoletti's *Hitler Youth: Growing Up in Hitler's Shadow* (Sibert Honor, 2006) is illustrated with photographs from many sources. Under these guidelines the author, but not the illustrations, would be eligible. (Medal awarded to both author and illustrator, when eligible, only since 2007.)

5. Where specifically noted (as in the Newbery Manual), a committee may consider books that are traditional in origin, if the book is the result of original research and the retelling and interpretation are the writer's own.

Example: On this point, Donna Jo Napoli's books *The Prince of the Pond, Otherwise Known as De Fawg Pin*, based on the folk tale "The Frog Prince," and *Zel*, based on the folk tale "Rapunzel," would be eligible, as would Robin McKinley's *Rose Daughter*, based on the folk tale "Sleeping Beauty."

6. Not all cases are clear-cut, and each committee must make its own judgments about originality. Where consensus is not easily reached, the Chair should discuss the issue with the Priority Consultant, who may also consult the President, the Executive Director, the Board, or previous chairs.

B. IN ENGLISH

IN ENGLISH - means that the committee considers only books **written and published in English**. This requirement DOES NOT limit the use of words or phrases in another language where appropriate in context. Bilingual books may be considered, with the understanding that the award is given for the English text. In such cases the committee should, if necessary, request that the non-English text be read by a native-speaker of that language to determine whether there are flaws that detract from the

book's excellence or that would limit its acceptance by readers in the second language

Note to the Board: The Task Force recommends that the underlined phrase be substituted in all five manuals everywhere that the words "in English" were previously inserted, for the sake of clarity.

Example:

The German author Cornelia Funke lived in California during the time she was writing one of the books in her *Inkworld* trilogy. Had the book been written in English, it might have been eligible for consideration based on her residency. However, because it was first written in German, it was not eligible.

(C) CHILDREN'S BOOK

CHILDREN'S BOOK - means a United States trade publication for which children, up to and including age 14, are a potential audience. Books for this entire age range are to be considered.

Example:

Frog and Toad Together, by Arnold Lobel, was a Newbery Honor Book in 1973, despite the young age of its intended audience.

NOTE: In some instances, award-winning books have been criticized for exceeding the upper age limit of fourteen. ALSC awards (with the exception of the Geisel award for books for beginning readers) are given to "children," defined as "persons of ages up to and including fourteen." Books for this entire age range are to be considered.

If a book is challenging, and suitable for 13-14-year-olds but not for younger readers, is it eligible? Yes; but it can be given an award only if it does what it sets out to do as well as or better than other, younger books that are also eligible. Questions for committees to consider include these:

- * Is this book suitable for ANY 14-year-old?
- * If so, is it distinguished enough to be considered?
- * If so, exactly what 14-year-olds would respond to it, and why?

Is there any 14-yr-old for whom this book is suitable?

A book may be considered even though it appeals to a fairly small part of the age range if the committee feels that

- * it is so distinguished that everyone of that age should know the book;
or
- * it is so distinguished, in so many ways, that it deserves recognition for the excellence it provides to a small but unique readership;
or
- * it is exceptionally fine for the narrow part of the range to which it appeals, even though it may be eligible for other awards outside this range.

(D) BOOK

BOOK - means that the work was published in book format (pages between covers) and is neither a condensation, excerpt, nor abridgement. Electronic books (e-books) and technological additions (including, but not limited to, CDs, DVDs, or accompanying websites) are specifically excluded from consideration of the book itself.

Examples:

1. A book published only in electronic format (e-book) is not eligible.
2. A book first published in electronic format (e-book) and subsequently published as a hardcover or paperback book is not eligible.
3. A picture-book version of Prokofiev's *Peter and the Wolf* with accompanying CD of a New York Philharmonic performance of the work may be considered, but ONLY the book itself is considered for the award. If the book should win, the citation should point out that although a CD is included with the book, the committee considered, and the award is given to, the book only (or, in this case, the illustrator).

(E) DISTINGUISHED, OUTSTANDING

DISTINGUISHED (as in "To select the most distinguished American picture book for children") - refers to the quality of the book as set out in the CRITERIA for each award and means noteworthy; excellent; outstanding; standing above all others. Definitions vary somewhat among the awards, as there are nuances specific to each award and what it recognizes.

From the Batchelder Manual:

4. "Most outstanding" refers to the quality of the book as defined by the CRITERIA (cited in the next section).

Quality of the United States Book:

- a. *The textual qualities to be evaluated will vary depending on the content and type of the book being considered. Each book should be evaluated only on the elements pertinent to it. These include*
 - *Interpretation of the theme or concept*
 - *Presentation of information including accuracy, clarity, and organization*
 - *Development of plot*
 - *Delineation of characters*
 - *Appropriateness of style*
- b. *In all cases, committee members must consider the book's manner of presentation for and the potential appeal to a child audience.*
- c. *Aspects of the overall design of the book should be considered when they significantly enhance or detract from the text, thus making the book more or less effective as a children's book. Such aspects might include illustration, type face, layout, book jacket, etc.*

In some children's books, illustrations are important. In considering such a book, consideration should be given to the retention of the original illustrator's work in the U.S. edition.

From the Caldecott Manual: "Distinguished" is defined as:

** marked by eminence and distinction; noted for significant achievement.*

** marked by excellence in quality.*

** marked by conspicuous excellence or eminence.*

** individually distinct.*

From the Geisel Manual: "Distinguished is defined as:

** marked by distinction; noted for significant achievement;*

** marked by excellence in quality;*

** marked by conspicuous excellence or eminence;*

** individually distinct;*

** providing a stimulating and successful reading experience for the beginning reader containing the kind of plot, sensibility, and rhythm that can carry a child along from start to finish.*

From the Newbery Manual: In identifying "Distinguished Writing" in a book for children,

a. Committee members need to consider the following:

- * Interpretation of the theme or concept
- * Presentation of information including accuracy, clarity, and organization
- * Development of a plot
- * Delineation of characters
- * Delineation of a setting
- * Appropriateness of style.

Note: Because the literary qualities to be considered will vary depending on content, the committee need not expect to find excellence in each of the named elements. The book should, however, have distinguished qualities in all of the elements pertinent to it.

b. Committee members must consider excellence of presentation for a child audience.

From the Sibert Manual:

* Distinguished is defined as noted for significant achievement; marked by quality, excellence, or eminence; distinctive.

* In identifying the most distinguished informational book for children from the preceding year, committee members consider important elements and qualities:

- * Excellent, engaging and distinctive use of language.
- * Excellent, engaging, and distinctive visual presentation.
- * Appropriate organization and documentation.
- * Clear, accurate, and stimulating presentation of facts, concepts, and ideas.
- * Appropriate style of presentation for subject and for intended audience..
- * Supportive features (index, table of contents, maps, timelines, etc.).
- * Respectful and of interest to children.

III. ELIGIBILITY OF AUTHOR/ILLUSTRATOR

Note: While there are numerous sources of information and committees should use them diligently in researching eligibility, it is often difficult to determine residency or citizenship. The committee Chair or the Priority Consultant may contact the publisher to determine citizenship or residency. Committee members may not do so.

→ Add
• From the
Wilder
Manual:

(A) RESIDENT

RESIDENT - means 1) that the author or illustrator has established and maintains residence in the United States, U.S. territory, or U.S. commonwealth, as distinct from being a casual or occasional visitor.

Or 2) that the author/illustrator meets one of the following criteria:

a) The author/illustrator, a citizen of another country, holds a "green card" and is a Permanent Resident Alien.

b) The author/illustrator lives for at least 6 months EVERY year in the United States, regardless of where the book was actually written.

c) A resident is also an individual whose permanent home is in the US but who is outside of the US for a temporary purpose. For example, an individual goes on vacation in another country or works there temporarily. The individual still maintains residency in the US and intends to return.

Examples:

A Polish author who had obtained a "green card" and had lived in Brooklyn, NY, for many years decided, when her home was being renovated, to spend a year in Poland with relatives before returning to Brooklyn. She was considered eligible during this period, even though she was temporarily living abroad, because she had established Permanent Resident status.

The British author Susan Cooper lived for many years in the Boston area, though she traveled widely and returned to Britain at times. She was considered eligible.

(B) CITIZEN

CITIZEN - means that the author/illustrator is considered by the government of the United States to be a U.S. Citizen, whether by birth or naturalization.

* This definition shall apply even if the author or illustrator obtains citizenship during the year in which a book is being considered.

[Note to the Board: We suggest this in the spirit of embracing, rather than walling out, anyone who might otherwise be ineligible in the year they become a citizen.]

AAETF DEFINITIONS

ADDENDUM

II. Eligibility of Book

A. Original Work

2. Further, "original work" means that the text (or illustrations, as applicable) is presented here for the first time IN PRINT and has not been previously published elsewhere in this or any other form. Text or illustrations reprinted or compiled from other sources are not eligible.

It is the intent of this restriction to insure that a book is a NEW creation, and not a re-creation from some other work. This does not mean that some minor portion of the work cannot have appeared elsewhere (for example, a photograph in a catalog of a single illustration, or the statement in another book of a concept). It does mean, however, that no significant part of the book under consideration was originally part of another work.

E. Distinguished, Outstanding

(add, after "From the Sibert Manual")

From the Wilder Manual:

3. "Over a period of years" means that at least some of the books by the potential nominee have been available to children during the 10-year period prior to nomination. Out-of-print books may be considered as part of the nominee's contribution, whether or not they were published during this 10-year period. A book need not have been published for the first time, but rather must have been available in print during some part of this ten-year period.

(Within the Wilder Manual, clarification is also needed under Part II, Committee Work: Eligibility:

"It is important to verify that

1. the books by nominated authors and illustrators have been published in the United States
2. some of the books have been available DURING THE 10-YEAR PERIOD PRIOR TO NOMINATION
3. that a portion of the nominee's active career in books for children must have occurred in the twenty-five years prior to the nomination.